

1 Guido Saveri (Bar No. 22349); guido@saveri.com
2 R. Alexander Saveri (Bar No. 173102); rick@saveri.com
3 Geoffrey C. Rushing (Bar No. 126910); crushing@saveri.com
4 Cadio Zirpoli (Bar No. 179108); cadio@saveri.com
5 **SAVERI & SAVERI, INC.**
6 706 Sansome Street
7 San Francisco, California 94111
8 Telephone: (415) 217-6810
9 Facsimile: (415) 217-6813

10 *Interim Lead Counsel for the Direct Purchasers*
11 *Additional counsel listed on signature page*

12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION

IN RE: CATHODE RAY TUBE (CRT)
ANTITRUST LITIGATION

MASTER FILE NO. 07-cv-5944 SC

MDL NO. 1917

This Document Relates to:
ALL DIRECT PURCHASER ACTIONS

**STIPULATION AND [PROPOSED]
ORDER CONCERNING PENDING
MOTIONS RE: FINISHED PRODUCTS**

1 **WHEREAS**, on March 16, 2009, the Direct Purchaser Plaintiffs (“DPPs”) filed a
 2 consolidated amended complaint (the “Direct CAC”) [dkt. no. 436];

3 **WHEREAS** the Direct CAC includes claims that Defendants have combined and
 4 conspired to fix, raise, maintain or stabilize the prices of finished products containing CRTs
 5 (“CRT Finished Products”), and/or have allocated markets or customers with respect to CRT
 6 Finished Products (said claims herein referred to as the “CRT Finished Products Conspiracy
 7 Claims”);

8 **WHEREAS**, Defendants Panasonic Corporation of North America, MT Picture Display
 9 Co., Ltd., Panasonic Corporation (f/k/a Matsushita Electric Industrial Co.), Hitachi, Ltd., Hitachi
 10 Asia, Ltd., Hitachi America, Ltd., Hitachi Electronic Devices (USA), Inc., Hitachi Displays, Ltd.,
 11 Samsung Electronics Co., Ltd., Samsung Electronics America, Inc. (hereinafter “Moving
 12 Defendants”) filed a motion Pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. Proc. 11 alleging that the CRT Finished
 13 Products Conspiracy Claims are without foundation and requesting that those allegations be
 14 stricken (the “Rule 11 Motion”) [dkt. no. 880];

16 **WHEREAS**, the DPPs filed a motion against Defendants Panasonic and MT seeking
 17 discovery with respect to finished products (“DPPs’ Motion to Compel CRT Finished Products
 18 Discovery”);

19 **WHEREAS**, on June 15, 2011, Special Master Legge issued a Report and
 20 Recommendation on Motions Regarding Finished Products recommending, in relevant part, as
 21 follows: (1) Moving Defendants’ Rule 11 Motion be granted; (2) DPPs’ allegations of a
 22 conspiracy that encompasses CRT Finished Products be stricken from the Direct CAC; and (3)
 23 DPPs’ Motion to Compel CRT Finished Products Discovery be denied [dkt. no. 947];

24 **WHEREAS**, on June 29, 2011 Moving Defendants filed a Motion to Adopt Special
 25 Master’s Report and Recommendations Regarding Finished Products [dkt. no. 953];

26 **WHEREAS**, on June 29, 2011, DPPs filed under seal an Objection to Special Master’s
 27 Report and Recommendations on Motions Regarding Finished Products [dkt. no. 957];

28 **WHEREAS**, DPPs and Moving Defendants have met and conferred concerning
 829015.1

1 Defendants' Motion to Adopt and the DPPs' Objection to the Special Master's Report and
 2 Recommendations, and entered into the agreement set forth below;

3 **IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGREED**, by and between counsel for the
 4 undersigned Plaintiffs and Defendants, that:

- 5 1. The portion of the Special Masters' Report and Recommendations on Motions
 Regarding Finished Products [dkt. no. 947] recommending a finding that DPPs violated
 F.R.C.P. Rule 11 is hereby vacated;
- 6 2. The remaining portions of the Special Masters' Report and Recommendations on
 Motions Regarding Finished Products [dkt. no. 947], including its factual conclusions
 that (a) the DPPs made an inquiry "reasonable under the circumstances" before filing a
 Direct CAC that contained claims encompassing a CRT Finished Products Conspiracy,
 (b) that, based on the information available to the DPPs before they filed the Direct
 CAC, they "have not demonstrated objectively reasonable evidentiary support, direct or
 circumstantial, for a conspiracy to fix the prices of CRT Finished Products," (c) the
 recommendation to deny DPPs' motion to compel Finished Products discovery (other
 than Finished Products discovery "limited to the issue of the impact or effect on
 Finished Product prices of the alleged conspiracy to fix the prices of the CRTs"), and
 all other factual conclusions are hereby adopted;
- 7 3. The DPPs hereby withdraw their CRT Finished Products Conspiracy Claims stated in
 the Direct CAC and the allegations of the Direct CAC purporting to allege a conspiracy
 encompassing Finished Products are stricken from the Direct CAC, provided, however,
 that the issue of the possible impact or effect of the alleged fixing of prices of CRTs on
 the prices of Finished Products shall remain in the case;
- 8 4. The DPPs hereby withdraw any and all requests for discovery regarding or relating to
 information in support of the CRT Finished Product Conspiracy Claims, and shall not
 reissue or issue new or similar requests for any such discovery, subject to Paragraph 6
 below;

5. Provided however, that the issue of the purported impact or effect of the alleged fixing of prices of the CRTs on the prices of Finished Products shall remain in the case, and is a proper subject of discovery;
6. There shall be no further motions based upon Fed. R. Civ. Proc. 11 relating to the CRT Finished Product Conspiracy allegations of the Direct CAC; and
7. The fact of this stipulation and evidence of any negotiations of this stipulation shall not be used in any litigation that is not part of, and does not become part of, this MDL.

DATED: August 25, 2011

Respectfully submitted,

By: /s/ Guido Saveri
Guido Saveri
R. Alexander Saveri
Geoffrey C. Rushing
Cadio Zirpoli
SAVERI & SAVERI, INC.
706 Sansome Street
San Francisco, CA 94111
Telephone: (415) 217-6810
Facsimile: (415) 217-6813

Interim Lead Counsel for Direct Purchaser Plaintiffs

By: /s/ Jeffrey L. Kessler
JEFFREY L. KESSLER (*pro hac vice*)
Email: jkessler@dl.com
A. PAUL VICTOR (*pro hac vice*)
Email: pvictor@dl.com
DEWEY & LEBOEUF LLP
1301 Avenue of the Americas
New York, NY 10019
Telephone: (212) 259-8000
Facsimile: (212) 259-7013

1 ALDO A. BADINI (257086)
2 Email: abadini@dl.com
3 **DEWEY & LEBOEUF LLP**
4 1950 University Avenue
East Palo Alto, California 94303
Telephone: (650) 845-7000
Facsimile: (650) 845-7333

5 STEVEN A. REISS (*pro hac vice*)
6 Email: steven.reiss@weil.com
7 DAVID L. YOHAI (*pro hac vice*)
8 Email: david.yohai@weil.com
9 DAVID E. YOLKUT (*pro hac vice*)
10 Email: david.yolkut@weil.com
WEIL, GOTSHAL, & MANGES LLP
767 Fifth Avenue
New York, New York 10153-0119
Telephone: (212) 310-8000
Facsimile: (212) 310-8007

11 GREGORY D. HULL (57367)
12 Email: greg.hull@weil.com
13 **WEIL, GOTSHAL & MANGES LLP**
14 201 Redwood Shores Parkway
Redwood Shores, California 94065-1175
Telephone: (650) 802-3000
Facsimile: (650) 802-3100

15 *Attorneys for Defendants Panasonic*
16 *Corporation of North America, MT Picture*
17 *Display Co., Ltd. and Panasonic Corporation*
(f/k/a Matsushita Electric Industrial Co.)

18 By: /s/ Kent M. Roger
19 KENT M. ROGER (95987)
Email: kroger@morganlewis.com
MICHELLE PARK CHIU (248421)
Email: mchiu@morganlewis.com
MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP
One Market, Spear Street Tower
San Francisco, California 94105-1126
Telephone: (415) 442-1000
Facsimile: (415) 442-1001

1 J. CLAYTON EVERETT, JR. (pro hac vice)
2 Email: jeverett@morganlewis.com
3 SCOTT A. STEMPREL (pro hac vice)
4 Email: sstempel@morganlewis.com
5 **MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP**
6 111 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
7 Washington, DC 20004
8 Telephone: (202) 739-3000
9 Facsimile: (202) 739-3001

10 *Attorneys for Defendants Hitachi Asia, Ltd.,
11 Hitachi America, Ltd., Hitachi Electronic
12 Devices (USA), Inc., and Hitachi Displays, Ltd.*

13 By: /s/ Ian Simmons
14 IAN SIMMONS (pro hac vice)
15 Email: isimmons@omm.com
16 BEN BRADSHAW (189925)
17 Email: bbradshaw@omm.com
18 **O'MELVENY & MYERS LLP**
19 1625 Eve Street, NW
20 Washnigton, DC 20006
21 Telephone: (202) 383-5300
22 Facsimile: (202) 383-5414

23 *Attorneys for Defendants Samsung Electronics
24 Co., Ltd. And Samsung Electronics America,
25 Inc.*

26 So Ordered.

27 Dated: August 26, 2011



28 Crt.451

829015.1